

# VU Research Portal

## The limits and possibilities of postmetaphysical God-talk

Meylahn, J.A.

2011

### **document version**

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

### **citation for published version (APA)**

Meylahn, J. A. (2011). *The limits and possibilities of postmetaphysical God-talk: A conversation between Heidegger, Levinas and Derrida*. [PhD-Thesis – Research external, graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

### **E-mail address:**

[vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl](mailto:vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl)

## Table of Contents

---

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	9
<i>Summary of study</i>	11
<i>Overzicht over de studie</i>	13
<i>Chapter One</i>	15
<i>The limits and possibilities of postmetaphysical God-talk. A conversation between Heidegger, Levinas and Derrida: An introduction</i>	
1. Introduction, rationale and delimitation of study	15
2. Problem statement and focus	22
3. Guiding questions	22
4. Method	22
5. Chapter layout	23
<i>Chapter Two</i>	25
<i>The limits and possibilities of Heidegger's wounded metaphysics and the limits and possibilities it offers to postmetaphysical God-talk</i>	
1. Introduction	25
1.1 Why Heidegger?	25
1.2 The limitations of his thought	26
1.3 The possibilities of his thought	27
1.4 Three interrelated thought-paths ( <i>Gedankenwege</i> ) towards the wounding of Metaphysics	29
2. <i>Verwundung der Metaphysik</i> : the wounding of metaphysics	30
2.1 The meaning of Being	31
2.2 <i>Aletheia</i> or <i>A-letheia</i> (the truth of Being)	42
2.2.1 Introduction	42
2.2.2 A turn ( <i>Kehre</i> ) on his earlier thinking and the development of the <i>Seinsgeschichte</i>	42
2.2.3 The Myth of the two beginnings	44
2.2.4 Thinking back to the great <i>Anfang</i> and the new Beginning and the possibilities of the truth ( <i>aletheia</i> ) of Being	46
2.2.5 Machination and lived experience and the truth of Be-ing	53

2.2.6	The Greek origin of machination and the possible other beginning	57
2.2.7	<i>Aletheia</i> : truth of Being	60
2.3	<i>Ereignis</i> (the event of Being or disclosure of appropriation)	62
2.3.1	The translation of <i>Ereignis</i>	64
2.3.2	Understanding <i>Ereignis</i>	65
3.	Language, the house of Being	72
4.	Limits and possibilities of wounded metaphysical God-talk	82
4.1	The limitations of the Last God in and as <i>Ereignis</i>	83
4.2	Possibilities of talking of the Last God	84
	<i>Chapter Three</i>	87
	<i>The limits and possibilities of Levinas' 'other otherwise' and the limits and possibilities it offers to postmetaphysical God-talk</i>	
1.	Introduction	87
2.	Ethics and towards a language of alterity	90
2.1	The self and the face of the Other towards ethical metaphysics	91
2.1.1	The face as the disruption of the totality	97
2.2	The naked self and the signification of substitution: <i>saying</i>	101
3.	The language of alterity: Transcendence and infinity towards possibilities of God-talk	113
4.	The (im)possibilities of Levinas' God-talk	120
4.1	The possibilities of Levinas' God-talk	122
4.1.1	God coming-to-idea in the thought of the trace in the face of the Other: <i>Illeity</i>	124
4.1.2	God coming-to-idea in the idea of the Infinite, the Infinite in me	128
4.1.3	God coming-to-idea in the Good beyond Being	131
4.2	God-talk	138
4.2.1	Creation	139
4.2.2	Election	140
4.2.3	"Here I am"	140
4.3	The impossibility of Levinas' God-talk	141
4.3.1	(Im)possibility of God-talk as prophetic signification	142

4.3.2	The (im)possibility of God-talk between <i>illeity</i> and <i>il y a</i>	144
4.3.3	(Im)possibility of God-talk: language, said and saying	146
5.	The (im)possibility of concluding a chapter on Levinas' God-talk	149
5.1	Always already in the world (in language) sub-jected to old signs to speak and reflect on the subjection of the self-for-the-Other	151
5.2	Being in the world and the coming to idea of God	154
	<i>Chapter four</i>	165
	<i>The limits and possibilities of Derrida's différance for postmetaphysical God-talk</i>	
1.	Impossible yet necessary introduction to Derrida's thought	165
2.	Speech – sign – writing – context	167
2.1	Where to begin: a supplemented beginning	167
2.2	The priority of speech in Western thought	175
2.3	The impossibility of thinking the sign without writing: speech is already writing	176
2.4	<i>Le texte en général</i> and autodeconstruction	188
2.5	Deconstruction	191
3.	Différance and the closure of metaphysics	194
3.1	Différance	195
3.2	The closure of metaphysics	203
4.	Heidegger, Levinas and Derrida at the end of philosophy or the closure of metaphysics and a vulnerability toward the <i>tout autre</i>	212
4.1	Derrida's interpretation of Heidegger	212
4.2	Derrida's interpretation of Levinas	221
4.2.1	The impossible or <i>the impossible</i>	222
4.2.2	Tout autre	223
4.2.3	The <i>advent within</i> language of that which is beyond language	224
4.2.4	The relationship to the feminine other	225
5	The limits and impossibilities of Derrida's God-talk: Derrida's yes and no to negative theology	225
5.1	The limits of Derrida's différance for postmetaphysical God-talk	230
5.1.1	Différance "is" not a transcendental signified nor a positive idea of a god or God	230
5.1.2	Différance "is" not negative theology	233

5.2	The possibilities of Derrida's <i>différance</i> for postmetaphysical God-talk	240
5.2.1	<i>Différance</i> is grammatological and not mystical and the return or the haunting of negative theology	244
5.3	Negative Theology: How to avoid speaking	253
5.3.1	Plato	254
5.3.2	Christian	266
5.3.3	Heidegger	269
5.4	Beyond proper names, theology without theology, religion without religion, theology without God, yet saving the name God	272
6	In-conclusion	282
	<i>Chapter Five</i>	285
	<i>The impossible possibilities of postmetaphysical God-talk. A conversation between Heidegger, Levinas and Derrida: Theopoetics and Holy Folly</i>	
1.	Introduction	285
2.	In summary: a conversation at the closure of Metaphysics	285
3.	The first oblique offering: to be already in the text is to begin with an image, a sign, an inscription. Is there any other beginning?	292
4.	The second oblique offering: The impossible possibility of Theopoetics as postmetaphysical God-talk	295
4.1	Theopoetics	296
4.2	Theopoetry and the danger of theopolitics	298
4.3	The temptations in the desert: the temptations in the name of God	300
4.3.1	The first temptation: the all-powerful author	301
4.3.2	The second temptation: conclusive meaning and thus certain knowledge	302
4.3.3	The third temptation: the power of order	303
4.3.4	Last temptation: Final judgment	304
4.4	Theopoetics between Theopoetry and Theopolitics and an exemplary narrative	304
5	The third oblique offering: The impossible possibility of holy folly as a possible postmetaphysical God-talk	315
5.1	Mōrosophia as the third way and alternative to both logos and mythos	318
5.1.1	Folly as the way to wisdom	321
5.1.2	Mōrosophia as the way in postmodernity at the closure of metaphysics	323

5.2	Byzantine Holy Fools and Erasmus' <i>In Praise of Folly</i>	323
5.2.1	Salos on the margins of the early Christian asceticism of the desert monasteries	329
6	Theopoetics (mōrosophia) and Holy Folly (salos): a dance of the impossible possibility	336
7	At the closure of a study	337
	<i>Bibliography</i>	339